

**COMMONWEALTH OF KENTUCKY
KENTUCKY BOARD OF TAX APPEALS
FILE NO. K05-S-03**

JAMES AND CONETTE NOLAN

APPELLANTS

V. ORDER NO. K-19529

**BELL COUNTY PROPERTY
VALUATION ADMINISTRATOR**

APPELLEE

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals delegated authority to a hearing officer pursuant to KRS 13B.030. The hearing officer entered a recommended order in compliance with the provisions of KRS 13B.110. No exceptions or objections to the recommended order were filed. The Board has reviewed the record and the recommended order.

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals conducted a hearing in this matter on April 19, 2006 and makes the following findings of fact, conclusions of law and recommended disposition.

FINDINGS OF FACT

This assessment appeal is for real property located at Arjay, KY 40902. The Bell County Property Valuation Administrator assessed the property at \$90,000.00. The taxpayer or Appellant values the property at \$50,000.00. The Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals valued the property at \$85,000.00. The Appellants filed a timely appeal from the local board with the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals.

The Appellants bought the property in 2004 for \$90,000.00. That PVA argues that the property is insured by the property owners for \$85,000.00 and the taxpayers paid family members the sum of \$90,000.00 knowing the location and the condition of the area where the property was located. Also evidence was presented that the property owners paid off a mortgage at L and N Credit Union in the amount of \$64,919.28 and a home equity loan at L and N Credit Union in the amount of \$19,094.74 when they purchased the property from family members. Also presented were comparable sales in the same area for similar properties sold recently in the amounts of \$87,900.00, \$66,500.00 and a smaller home for \$55,000.00. These properties were sold for an average of \$45.67 per square foot.

The Appellant offered the following evidence in support of Appellant's appeal: The Nolans stated that their property was located next to trailers and property covered with old cars and other debris and this should reduce their taxable basis. Their argument was basically that the prior property owners had only been paying taxes on a valuation of \$25,000.00 and this is what they expected to be taxed on since they purchased the property from family members.

It is the finding of this hearing that the Appellant did not sustain their burden of proof regarding their challenge to the final order of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals. The Nolans knew the location and condition of the property when the property was purchased, their property was appraised for \$38.00 per square foot, less than the comparables and the property is insured for \$85,000.00 which is the amount the local board valued the property.

Based upon the evidence in the record, it is the finding of this board, acting through its hearing officer, Nancy Mitchell, that the fair cash value of the property in question as of January 1, 2005 is \$85,000.00.

CONCLUSIONS OF LAW

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals is vested with exclusive jurisdiction to hear and determine appeals from final rulings, orders and determinations of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals, pursuant to KRS 131.340(1).

The function of the Board is not simply to review the action of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals, but to try anew the issues as presented. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator v. Oxford Properties, Inc.*, Ky. App., 726 S. W. 2nd 317, 319 (1987). See KRS 131.340(1).

Section 172 of the Kentucky Constitution mandates that “all property shall be assessed for taxation at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring a fair voluntary sale.”

The choice of the most appropriate and reliable approach to valuation is within the prerogative of the Board. *Jefferson County Property Valuation Administrator*, 726 S.W. 2d at 319.

Regardless of the manner or method used by the Property Valuation Administrator or the decision of the Kentucky tax Board of Appeals, the finding of valuation must be at its fair cash value, estimated at the price it would bring at a fair voluntary sale. *Helman v. Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals*, Ky.App., 554 S. W. 2d 889 (1977).

As the party proposing that the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals set aside the decision of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals, the Appellants have the burden of proving a lower value. KRS 13B.090(7).

If the property is sold at or near the assessment date in a fair and voluntary sale, the sale price is usually the best evidence of the property's fair cash value. *Sears, Roebuck & Company v. Boone County Board of Assessment Appeals*, Ky. App., 715 S. W. 2d 888, 889 (1986).

Based upon the facts as established in this hearing, the Board acting through its hearing officer concludes that the fair cash value of the subject property as of January 1, 2005 is \$85,000.00.

RECOMMENDED ORDER

It is recommended that the June 22, 2005 final ruling of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals be upheld and the real property be assessed at a fair cash value of \$85,000.00 as of January 1, 2005.

Each party shall have fifteen (15) days from the date any recommended order is mailed within which to file exceptions to the recommendations with the agency head. Transmittal of a recommended order may be sent by regular mail to the last known address of the party.

FINAL ORDER

The Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals has considered the record and accepts the recommended order of the hearing officer, and adopts it as the Board's final order.

Failure to file exceptions to an administrative hearing officer's recommendations after a hearing constitutes a failure to exhaust administrative remedies and precludes appellate review. *Swatzell v. Natural Resources and Environmental Protection Cabinet*, Ky App 962 SW 2d 866 (1998).

The June 22, 2005 final ruling of the Bell County Board of Assessment Appeals is upheld and the real property is to be assessed at a fair cash value of \$85,000.00 as of January 1, 2005.

The following information is provided pursuant to the final order requirements of KRS Chapter 13B:

This is a final and appealable order. All final orders of this agency shall be subject to judicial review in accordance with the provisions of KRS Chapter 13B. A party shall institute an appeal by filing a petition in the Circuit Court of venue, as provided in the agency's enabling statutes, within thirty (30) days after the final order of the agency is mailed or delivered by personal service. If venue for appeal is not stated in the enabling statutes, a party may appeal to Franklin Circuit Court or the Circuit Court of the county in which the appealing party resides or operates a place of business. Copies of the petition shall be served by the petitioner upon the agency and all parties of record. The petition shall include the names and addresses of all parties to the proceeding and the agency involved, and a statement of the grounds on which the review is requested. The petition shall be accompanied by a copy of the final order.

A party may file a petition for judicial review only after the party has exhausted all administrative remedies available within the agency whose action is being challenged, and within any other agency authorized to exercise administrative review.

A petition for judicial review shall not automatically stay a final order pending the outcome of the review, unless:

- (a) An automatic stay is provided by statute upon appeal or at any point in the administrative proceedings;
- (b) A stay is permitted by the agency and granted upon request; or
- (c) A stay is ordered by the Circuit Court of jurisdiction upon petition.

Within twenty (20) days after service of the petition of appeal, or within further time allowed by the Circuit Court, the Kentucky Board of Tax Appeals shall transmit to the reviewing court the original or a certified copy of the official record of the proceeding under review in compliance with KRS 13B.140(3).

**DATE OF ORDER
AND MAILING: June 15, 2006**

**FULL BOARD CONCURRING.
KENTUCKY BOARD OF TAX APPEALS**

**NANCY MITCHELL
CHAIR**